

# Minutes

of a meeting of the

## Planning Committee

held on Wednesday, 15 November 2017 at 6.30 pm  
in the The Ridgeway, The Beacon, Portway,  
Wantage, OX12 9BY



**Open to the public, including the press**

### Present:

Members: Councillors Sandy Lovatt (Chairman), Janet Shelley (Vice-Chairman), St John Dickson, Robert Hall, Jenny Hannaby, Bob Johnston, Ben Mabbett and Chris McCarthy

Officers: Emily Hamerton, Martin Deans, Laura Hudson and Nicola Meurer

### PI.104 Chairman's announcements

The chairman welcomed everyone to the meeting, outlined the procedure to be followed and advised on emergency evacuation arrangements.

### PI.105 Apologies for absence

Councillors Catherine Webber, Anthony Hayward and Stuart Davenport had tendered their apologies.

### PI.106 Minutes

**RESOLVED:** to approve the minutes of the meeting held on 25 October 2017 as a correct record and agree that the Chairman sign these as such.

### PI.107 Declarations of interest

Councillors Bob Johnston, Janet Shelley and Jenny Hannaby declared that in relation to application P17/V2009/HH, they are acquainted with the agent for the application, Mike Gilbert, as he is a former Vale of White Horse employee.

For the same application, Councillor Ben Mabbett declared that he had sat on the Wantage Town Council planning committee and voted on this item and therefore considered himself to be predetermined and would therefore be standing down for this item. Councillor Jenny Hannaby is also a member of Wantage Town Council, but did not take part in the discussion or decision for this item.

### PI.108 Urgent business

The Chairman had given consent for an application for prior approval notification under Class A of Part 6 of Schedule 2 of the Town and Country Planning (General Permitted Vale of White Horse District Council - Planning Committee Minutes

Development) Order 2015 to be considered as an urgent item, the application is for the erection of a grain store at The Old Stables, Fernham Road, Shellingford. The applicant is Cllr Robert Sharpe and therefore the application had to be considered by the Planning Committee. The Planning Department have 28 days to consider whether the proposal requires prior approval or whether it is in effect permitted development. It therefore had to be considered as an urgent item.

Policy and guidance were detailed in the addendum report and presented by the Development Manager.

A motion, moved and seconded, to authorise the head of planning in consultation with the chairman, to issue a decision to the effect that prior approval is not required, was declared carried on being put to the vote.

**RESOLVED:** to authorise the head of planning in consultation with the chairman, to issue a decision to the effect that prior approval is not required.

Any updates since publication of the agenda were detailed in the addendum report for all planning applications to be considered.

### **PI.109 Public participation**

The list showing members of the public who had registered to speak was tabled at the meeting.

### **PI.110 P17/V0205/FUL - Land adjoining 16 Yarnells Road, North Hinksey, Oxford**

Councillor Sandy Lovatt stepped down from the committee and took no part in the debate or voting for this item; Councillor Janet Shelley chaired the item.

The committee considered application P17/V0205/FUL, to erect a three-bedroom bungalow and access drive on land adjoining 16 Yarnells Road, North Hinksey, Oxford.

Consultations, representations, policy and guidance and the site's planning history were detailed in the officer's report which formed part of the agenda pack for this meeting and the addendum report, which had been circulated to committee.

Philip Booth, a local resident, spoke objecting to the application.

Debby Hallett, one of the local ward councillors, was unable to attend the committee but had submitted a statement to committee members, which was also included in the addendum report.

In response to questions raised by the committee, the officers reported that a daylight assessment can be requested to establish the impact on neighbouring properties.

A motion, moved and seconded, to defer the application to request a daylight assessment, was declared carried on being put to the vote.

**RESOLVED:** to defer consideration of application P17/V0205/FUL to carry out a daylight assessment in order to establish the impact on the neighbouring properties.

## **PI.111 P17/V2413/FUL - Hatherton, The Ridgeway, Boars Hill, Oxford**

The committee considered application P17/V2413/FUL, for a replacement detached dwelling and detached garage/office with associated landscaping at Hatherton, The Ridgeway, Boars Hill, Oxford.

Consultations, representations, policy and guidance and the site's planning history were detailed in the officer's report which formed part of the agenda pack for this meeting. Following further submissions received from a neighbour since publication of the agenda as detailed in the addendum report, three extra conditions had been recommended for inclusion concerning: site levels; a management plan for the importation of materials to the site; and a management plan for the timing of construction vehicles using the site.

Cathy Peedle and George Lambrick spoke objecting to the application.

Simon Handy, the applicant's agent, spoke in support of the application.

In response to questions raised by the committee, the officers reported that:

- Extra conditions can be included concerning the removal of permitted development rights; landscaping, management of the importation of material and slab level details to be submitted and approved before commencement of development.
- Clarification concerning the special circumstances that would allow this development under current greenbelt policy: the fall-back position is that with lawful permitted development extensions the volume of the proposed dwelling and the existing dwelling (with authorised extensions) is equivalent and therefore the argument that replacement dwellings should not be "materially larger" in the greenbelt is not supportable. Advertising the departure from policy to the Secretary of State is also not advised, as there is a minimum threshold for new buildings with a floor space of 1,000 sq. metres or where there is a significant impact on openness, which this application does not merit.

A motion, moved and seconded, to approve the application with the recommended extra conditions concerning: the removal of permitted development rights for extensions and restricting conversion of the garage; details of levels and materials; landscaping; and a construction management plan was declared carried on being put to the vote.

**RESOLVED:** to grant planning permission for application P17/V0205/FUL, subject to the following conditions:

1. Commencement three years - full planning permission.
2. Approved plans.
3. Final site levels to be submitted and approved prior to development.
4. Tree protection measures.
5. Management plan for importation of material to the site.
6. Management plan for the timing of construction vehicles using the site.
7. Materials to be submitted and approved prior to development.
8. Bat protection.
9. Removal of permitted development rights for extensions and restricting the conversion of the garage.
10. Landscaping scheme to be agreed.

## PI.112 P17/V2009/HH - Castle Farm Barn, Manor Road, Wantage

Councillors St John Dickson and Ben Mabbett stepped down from the committee and took no part in the debate or voting for this item.

The committee considered application P17/V2009/HH, to erect a detached garage with home office above at Castle Farm Barn, Manor Road, Wantage.

Consultations, representations, policy and guidance and the site's planning history were detailed in the officer's report which formed part of the agenda pack for this meeting. Following further submissions received from a neighbour since publication of the agenda as detailed in the addendum report, an extra condition is recommended for inclusion to restrict the use of the office for ancillary purposes.

Paul Mason, a local resident, spoke objecting to the application.

Mike Gilbert, the applicant's agent, spoke in support of the application.

St John Dickson, one of the local ward councillors, spoke objecting to the application.

In response to questions raised by the committee, the officers reported that:

- The application is on the same location but a larger footprint than that which has extant permission, which is within the residential curtilage of the property.

Committee members considered this application to be an overdevelopment of the site and were not satisfied with the impact that it would have on the North Wessex Downs Area of Outstanding Natural Beauty, as highlighted by the AONB Officer's comments that:

- The pitched roof is intrusive; and
- It would be harmful to the quality of the landscape, including views from the Ridgeway National Trail.

Some members were not sufficiently clear on whether the site was on residential or agricultural land from the maps provided.

A motion, moved and seconded, to refuse the application was declared carried on being put to the vote.

**RESOLVED:** to refuse planning permission for application P17/V2009/HH, for the following reasons:

That the proposed garage by reason of its scale, bulk and pitched roof, would have a harmful and intrusive impact on the character of the area and would not conserve the natural beauty of the AONB in which it is located, particularly when viewed from the wider landscape, including the Ridgeway National Trail. As such the proposal is contrary to saved policy NE6 of the adopted Local Plan 2011, Policies CP37 and CP44 of the adopted Local Plan 2031 Part 1 and the NPPF.

The meeting closed at 8.00 pm

Chairman

Date